Welcome

Please help yourself to breakfast.
Agenda:

8:00-8:45am: Registration & Breakfast
8:45-8:55am: Welcome
8:55-9:25am: Vanessa Perez, JHU
9:25-9:55am: Q&A and Discussion
9:55-10:00am: Closing
How the 2016 Campaigns Use (and Don't Use) Data

GAB Forum
Dr. Vanessa M. Perez
October 13, 2015
No Ground Game!

Donald Trump’s Ground Game Questioned After Iowa Showing

By MAGGIE HABERMAN and NICK CORASANITI    FEB 4, 2016

Mr. Trump visited his campaign headquarters Thursday in Manchester, N.H. Damon Winter/The New York Times
No Ground Game!

Donald Trump’s ground-game problem

Republican Presidential candidate Donald Trump speaks during a campaign rally, Saturday, June 11, 2016, at a private hanger at Greater Pittsburgh International Airport in Moon, Pa. (AP Photo/Keith Srakocic) ** FILE ** more >
No Ground Game!

DONALD TRUMP’S GROUND-GAME: UPS CAMPAIGN STOPS, NOT DATA-DRIVEN OUTREACH

by ALEX SWYER | 8 Feb 2016 | Washington, DC | 64
Trump Wins NH!
Trump Wins VA!

PROJECTED WINNER

VIRGINIA
49 DELEGATES

GOP PRIMARY
DONALD TRUMP

MSNBC
Trump Wins FL!
“A president who speaks his mind and not just when it behooves him to do so, who doesn’t have to run a focus group or use data analytics to be able to form a simple opinion, who says what needs to be said and not just what you want to hear.”

Donald Trump Jr. (RNC - July 19, 2016)
Overrated

- "I've always felt it was overrated. Obama got the votes much more so than his data processing machine. And I think the same is true with me."

-Donald J. Trump

• No Data Analytics → Victory? 😐
Overview

• What kind of data do campaigns use
• How do campaigns use data?
• Data-Driven Campaigns 2000-2014
• How 2016 Campaigns Use (or Don’t Use) Data
Why Data?

• Campaign Goal = win elections!
• However: limited $

• Get Out The Vote on:
  • Likely supporters
  • Persuadable voters
What Data?

- Voter Files
- HAVA (2002)
- Colorado Voter File Data
- Ohio Voter File Data
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>LAST_NAME</th>
<th>FIRST_NAME</th>
<th>MIDDLE_NAME</th>
<th>DATE_OF_BIRTH</th>
<th>REGISTRATION_DATE</th>
<th>VOTER_STATUS</th>
<th>PARTY_AFFILIATION</th>
<th>RESIDENTIAL_ADDRESS1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SPIRES</td>
<td>TIMOTHY</td>
<td>NELSON</td>
<td>7/10/1957</td>
<td>12/1/1976</td>
<td>ACTIVE</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>557 CHESTNUT RIDGE RD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VELZKA</td>
<td>RENEE</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>11/16/1960</td>
<td>3/6/2012</td>
<td>ACTIVE</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>2426 FENTON RD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NEWMAN</td>
<td>JOHN</td>
<td>BARTON</td>
<td>8/31/1946</td>
<td>10/3/1975</td>
<td>ACTIVE</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>26920 SR 41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MACK</td>
<td>SHARON</td>
<td>JEAN</td>
<td>1/1/1952</td>
<td>9/29/1977</td>
<td>ACTIVE</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>100 AMBER DR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MICHAEL</td>
<td>JENNA</td>
<td>SUE</td>
<td>9/8/1985</td>
<td>1/13/2003</td>
<td>ACTIVE</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>105 SMART RD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GROOMS</td>
<td>DENNIS</td>
<td>CARL</td>
<td>8/10/1955</td>
<td>9/8/1987</td>
<td>ACTIVE</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>3086 WEST FORK RD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WICKERHAM</td>
<td>RUTH</td>
<td>ELLEN</td>
<td>1/17/1931</td>
<td>9/29/1965</td>
<td>ACTIVE</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>18700 SR 247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BOOROM</td>
<td>KENNETH</td>
<td>CHARLES</td>
<td>10/11/1941</td>
<td>10/7/1994</td>
<td>ACTIVE</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>345 NIXON RD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COCKRELL</td>
<td>SUSAN</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>9/6/1957</td>
<td>8/29/2007</td>
<td>ACTIVE</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>2656 BLACKS RUN RD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McNEILAN</td>
<td>TERRY</td>
<td></td>
<td>8/6/1978</td>
<td>11/19/2015</td>
<td>ACTIVE</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>1080 BACON FLAT RD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SEAMAN</td>
<td>DAVID</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>2/9/1970</td>
<td>2/10/1988</td>
<td>ACTIVE</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>137 VAUGHN RIDGE RD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GROOMS</td>
<td>BRIAN</td>
<td>LEE</td>
<td>2/21/1968</td>
<td>4/7/1986</td>
<td>ACTIVE</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>2386 POPLAR RIDGE RD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BARNETT</td>
<td>TINA</td>
<td>L</td>
<td>10/2/1968</td>
<td>7/17/2007</td>
<td>CONFIRMATION</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>310 RICE DR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FRALEY</td>
<td>JOHN</td>
<td>WILLIAM</td>
<td>12/15/1952</td>
<td>7/27/2012</td>
<td>ACTIVE</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>7851 SR 348</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YATES</td>
<td>JUSTIN</td>
<td>W</td>
<td>6/14/1993</td>
<td>8/6/2012</td>
<td>ACTIVE</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>112 MOUND ST</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BROWN</td>
<td>TRAVIS</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>3/27/1979</td>
<td>7/27/2012</td>
<td>CONFIRMATION</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>49 FROST AVE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GROOMS</td>
<td>SHAWN</td>
<td>DAVID</td>
<td>9/2/1968</td>
<td>8/30/1986</td>
<td>ACTIVE</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>2900 TATER RIDGE RD</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Party ID & Race

- **Six Party registration States:**
  - Colorado
  - Florida
  - Iowa
  - New Hampshire
  - Nevada
  - North Carolina

- **Two non-party registration States:**
  - Virginia
  - Wisconsin

- **States with Records of Racial identity**
  - Alabama
  - Florida
  - Georgia
  - Louisiana
  - Mississippi
  - North Carolina
  - South Carolina
  - Tennessee
## Predictions of Race

### Race Predicted from Public Records vs. Commercial Data

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Race</th>
<th>Commercial Data</th>
<th>Voter File Data</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>% Correctly Predicted</td>
<td>Obs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>18,528</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>2,403</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hispanic</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>1,898</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Reproduced from: Hersh, Eitan (2015)
Other Data

- Consumer data
  - Phone records
  - Credit card data
  - Car ownership
  - Alcohol
  - Gun ownership
  - Hunting

- Email lists (obtained from campaign contacts)
- Browser cookies
- Canvassing data
- Donor lists
- Survey data
How is Data Used?

• Predictive models

• Key attributes:
  • Likelihood of supporting candidate
  • Persuadability
  • Voting

• But also:
  • Likelihood to respond to email, in-person visit, mailing
  • Likelihood of mailing back a registration form
  • Likelihood to donate
Predictive Modeling

• Conduct poll
• Match individuals to voter file
• Look for patterns in data
• Models yield probabilities (scores) on
  • Likelihood to support candidate
  • Likelihood to vote
  • Likelihood to be persuadable
Predictive Scores

Who to:

- Call
  - Phone Calls
  - Automated calls
- Visit
  - In person
  - Community Outreach
- Direct Mail
- Electronic Mail (emails)
- Advertisement
  - Tv-ad placement
  - Web-ad placement
- Social Media Outreach
  - Facebook
  - Twitter
Perceived Voters

• Based on probability voter has specific attributes
  • (married, Rep/Dem, have children)

• If state has party ID data → Target partisans

• If not → Target perceived voters

(BUT RISK SPENDING RESOURCES ON OPPONENTS OR NON-PERSUADABLE VOTERS)
Persuadable Perceived Voters

- Who are the persuadables?

- Independents & Habitual Voters?

- Voters targeted as persuadable very different from those who appear in surveys as persuadable
  - (independents, wait until last minute)

- Innovations in 2016 race?
Creating People through Data

Cobb: I wish. I wish more than anything. But I can't imagine you with all your complexity, all you perfection, all your imperfection. Look at you. You are just a shade of my real wife. You're the best I can do; but I'm sorry, you are just not good enough.
Risks in Targeting

Women For Trump <women@donaldjtr

To: [Content cut off]

You are getting this email as you are a Trump supporter in your state.

We are reaching out to you for your support.

Please like our FB page: https://www.facebook.com/NationalWomenforTrump/

Donald Trump will defeat ISIS once and for all.

THE TRUMP PLAN TO MAKE AMERICA SAFE AGAIN
- Pause immigration from countries that sponsor terror
- End the stream of Syrian refugees entering our country
- Call violence by Islamic extremists what it is - terrorism
Evolution of Data-Driven Campaigns 1999-2000

- Republican to Democratic advantage
- Republicans pioneered data-driven approaches
  - **Voter Vault**: Republican voter file data & interface
Evolution of Data-Driven Campaigns 1999-2000

• Appending consumer data

• Field experiments
  • In-person canvassing best
  • Neighborhood volunteers best for persuasion
McCain 2000 Campaign Innovative

- First with webpage
- Online phone banking tool
McCain 2000 Campaign Innovative

- Online fundraising ($6 million)
- 160,000 email list (tapped to raise $)
• Emails to recruit volunteers
• **Parties for the President** (31,000 parties)
• Rewards for volunteers (free screensaver)
Walk or Party for the President

On Oct. 16 & 17 thousands will organize a walk of their neighborhood to help encourage their neighbors to vote for President Bush. Get started now by inviting your friends to your home to go knock on doors asking people to vote!

-Register at GeorgeWBush.com
-Get list of nearby targeted voters & script to deliver
-Visit household
-Record results of canvass & send back to campaign
Democrats 2004-2008

• Dean’s 2004 innovations
  • Meetups, MeetUp.com
  • Online fundraising (40% of 50 million raised online)
  • First campaign blog (& blog interview w/candidate)
VoteBuilder

- VoteBuilder (DNC’s voter file) & NGP VAN (interface)
  - 2007 nationalized voter file
  - States send files, campaigns add data,
Obama 2008-2012

• Massive email lists
• Extensive voter files
• Technology for accessing & updating file in field
Obama 2008-2012

• **By 2012:** 800 data points on each voting age individual

• Innovation:
  • Voter file updated & supplemented on constant basis
  • Predictive scores updated accordingly

**Example: NC 2012 campaign:**
- 23 polls a week before the election
- provides campaign information on how subgroups & individuals change minds over time
Facebook 2012

• Obama 2012 app:
  • 1 million installed

• Campaign gets friend list & targets

• FB:
  • 2016 → No friend data
Data Analytics Institutions

- 2004-2014
- Dems 67 data analytics firms
- Reps: 15 firms

Organizational Founding by Democratic and Republican Technology Staffers on Presidential Campaigns From 2004-2012
Clinton 2016

Elan Kriegel
Clinton Director of Analytics

Data Analysts
Brooklyn Office
Clinton 2016: Innovations

• Field experiments
  • when is best to contact voters?
  • greater integration with academic research

• TV Tool for primaries
  • predicts support at congressional district level, campaign targets media market with ads based on predictive scores

• Webpage changes
  • encourage donors to save credit card info, facilitates constant donations
Clinton 2016: App Innovations

Field the Bern
- Learn how to canvas.
- Quickly reference policy information.
- Find doors to knock on.
- Track progress and compete with friends.

Hillary 2016
- Fill in the blank: The U.S. economy would have produced an additional _____ in 2015 if women received equal pay.
- Weekly leaders:
  - Tim B. (2015 Points)
  - Danny M. (1026 Points)
  - Bruno C. (819 Points)
  - Stephanie C. (227 Points)
- Autographed sign: Souvenir signed by Hillary!
Hillary’s Trump Yourself App
Nonpartisan, Nonprofits 2016

• Don Green & Civic Nation *field experiments*

• Election Day Festivals
  • make voting a social activity

• Goal → boost turnout
Election Day Festivals

• First conducted in presidential election
• Inner cities & suburban areas
• Boost turnout by 3%

$11 per vote, Green expects costs to decrease in 2016 experiments
Republicans post-2013

- Growth & Opportunity Project (2013)
  - Goal: Strengthen data infrastructure to be competitive with Democratic Party
Cruz v. Trump 2016 Primaries

Data-Driven Campaign

Big rallies, no data?
Cambridge Analytica

- British firm

- Five-factor model:
  - openness,
  - conscientiousness
  - extroversion
  - agreeableness
  - neuroticism.

- Targeting depends on how you score on traits
CA Knows You Better Than You Know Yourself!

- Low on consciousness & agreeableness

- Campaign targets with messages:
  - “He’s got new ideas, fresh ideas, innovative ideas—you’ll be able to file your taxes on a postcard, whatever, abolish the IRS.
  - Cruz is an outsider!

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Same demographics, different personalities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Female 25-35 years old AMEX User</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Openness ▏Conscientiousness ▏Extraversion ▏Agreeableness ▏Neuroticism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People with high openness and extraversion love new experiences they can share with lots of people.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Female 25-35 years old AMEX User</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Openness ▏Conscientiousness ▏Extraversion ▏Agreeableness ▏Neuroticism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People with low openness and extraversion really value down time spent with their closest friends.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Trump 2016 Data Strategy

• Unlikely voters!

• “100% of effort in enfranchising ... low propensity voters”

• “A Radically Different Strategy for a Radically Different Candidate”
“Radically Different Strategy for Radically Different Candidate”

• Voter Math: Two Coefficients

  • $X_P \times Y_T = \text{Outcome}$
  
  ▪ $P = \text{likelihood of voting in Republican primary}$
  ▪ $T = \text{likelihood of supporting Trump}$

• Trump supporters = Low $P$ & High $T$
“Radically Different Strategy for Radically Different Candidate”

• Goal: Love Our Candidate, Did Vote $1P \times 1T = 1$ Vote

• Ignore High P voters! (Trump has free media)
  • Campaign wants: Low P High T voters
  • Another advantage: other candidates will ignore Low P voters!
  • Low P voters often referred to as: “stupid,” “racists,” and “bigots.”

• Warm message:
  • “I’m a volunteer for Mr. Trump’s campaign for President” “We’d like you join us, to help us Make America Great Again. Can we count on your vote in the upcoming primary?” (safe space)
Trump’s General Election Data Strategy

Trump, once a data skeptic, spending millions on data
by: JULIE BYKOWICZ, Associated Press Updated: Oct 6, 2016 - 11:56 AM

[Image of Trump, Ivanka, Jared, and Melania]
Trump’s General Election Data Strategy

- Trump campaign hired Cambridge Analytica
- App: “America First”
  - Rewards
  - Engage others
  - Donations
Too little, too late?

• Time needed to increase efficiency

• Better allocation of time, money, volunteers

• Advantage of data-driven campaign:
  • Enhance email lists
  • Build large volunteer base
  • Increase online donations (small donors)
Where do the Parties Go Next?

• Republicans
  ➢ Party might lag behind competition

• Democrats
  ➢ Need to maintain & innovate on data infrastructure
Thank you!